

Kindly direct correspondence to  
Leo Williams ([lwilliams@beyond2015.org](mailto:lwilliams@beyond2015.org))  
**Beyond 2015** International Coordinator  
c/o Concord a.i.s.b.l  
10 Square Ambiorix  
1000 Brussels, Belgium

Brussels, 30 April, 2014

## **Subject: Beyond 2015 reaction to and recommendations on the OWG Focus Area Document**

Dear Open Working Group members

**Beyond 2015**, a global civil society campaign consisting of over 1000 CSOs in over 100 countries, welcomes the 'Working Document for OWG-11', which builds on the Focus Areas Document discussed in OWG 10. We congratulate the co-chairs for their able leadership, registering such progress in such a short time and most importantly ensuring essential levels of economic and social rights are highlighted and that climate change retains the level of visibility required. The +1000 CSOs making up **Beyond 2015**, continue to call on the OWG to remain focused on producing an agenda that is **universal, ambitious, transformational, human rights-based and responsive to the realities of those most affected by poverty and injustice**. It is encouraging to see that this version of the Focus Areas Document takes us closer to that. We offer a number of key comments on the document in this letter, and specific textual recommendations on the targets in annex.

### **Inequality**

We welcome the inclusion of equality targets prioritizing progress for marginalised groups and the focus areas on gender equality and women's empowerment. However, we are extremely concerned by the deletion of Focus Area 12: 'Promote Equality'. The fact that the OWG is trying to mainstream equality across several focal areas, and integrate it into 'industrialization and growth', points towards addressing inequalities solely through the prism of economic growth. This departure weakens the 'leave no one behind' principle and seems to place trickle-down economics as the main driver of sustainable development. Equality is fundamental and should be featured under each focus area but should also be a focus area of its own, and we ask Member States to continue pushing for the inclusion of equality as a separate focus area.

### **Human rights**

It is concerning that the document still fails to ensure a genuine human rights based approach, or to make references to pre-existing human rights agreements. A truly human rights based approach would ensure "zero" goals and targets, a focus on reaching the poorest and most marginalised first, on improving equality both within and between countries, on ensuring the participation of all people in decision-making that concerns their lives, and on empowering all people in all domains. **Beyond 2015**'s participatory research and national CSO deliberations have shown that development fails the poorest when decision-making processes that affect their lives exclude them, and the post-2015 agenda must take this research into account.

We recognize important improvements in the proposals to recognise the universality of human rights, and to ensure minimum essential levels of economic and social rights, an immediate obligation under human rights law. That said, it is unfortunate that these socioeconomic goals and targets are not recognized as human rights in themselves, which would improve accountability and public uptake of them. We are also concerned that the paper does not recognize the indivisibility and interdependence of all human rights, and does not commit States, international organizations and businesses to ensure that their laws and policies related to the SDGs are designed and implemented in a manner consistent with existing human rights standards. We also recommend that the OWG takes us further than the MDG approach, recognizing that civil and political rights guarantees are absolutely critical to empower citizen-led sustainable development, and thus focusing also on civil and political rights protected under international law, such as the freedom of assembly, meaningful political participation, the right to information and protection of civil society space and human rights and environmental defenders.

One of the most concerning elements of the paper is the lack of clear provisions to ensure that the private sector and international financial institutions remain accountable and fully respect human rights and the environment. It is crucial to adopt targets which incentivize governments to take concrete measures to prevent business-related human rights and environmental abuses, by mandating independent, rigorous and periodic human rights and

environmental impact assessments of all large, influential businesses.

### **Overemphasis on economic growth**

We appeal to the OWG to take note of the contradiction between sustainable development and the current growth paradigm. The OWG continues to over-emphasise economic growth, assuming that that it leads to development for the poorest and most marginalised – which participatory research has shown not to be the case. It does not question the prevailing economic paradigm, which has led us to ever widening inequalities. The document also focuses on 'sustained economic growth', which is incompatible with the objectives of sustainable consumption and production and development within environmental limits. This document relies on 'business as usual', rather than transformational reform of economic structures, financial systems, trade, global governance and increasing accountability of the private sector. Proposals on macroeconomic policy and regulatory and fiscal systems are crucial and should be reinstated.

### **Peaceful and inclusive societies, rule of law and capable institutions**

The inclusion of Focus Area 16 on 'Peaceful and inclusive societies, rule of law and capable institutions' is strongly welcomed. This is a politically sensitive issue for a small number of countries, and it is important that consensus can be found and that this area is retained, as it is a key value for **Beyond 2015**, and absolutely integral to the success of the post-2015 agenda.

### **Climate change and the carrying capacity of the earth**

It is positive to see that many focus areas include targets contributing to climate change mitigation, adaptation and resilience, including food and agriculture, cities, SCP, energy. However, the focus areas on economic growth and means of implementation do not include climate-related targets - this poses a risk that areas sometimes framed as most important drivers for post-2015 development are not 'climate-proof'.

Respect for the limitations of the carrying capacity of our planet and the need to protect global commons is not prominent enough in the current draft. Specific % / yearly targets should be binding and in line with science and the precautionary principle. It is crucial that the OWG recognises that all growth must occur within the ecological carrying capacity of the earth, no matter how hard this might be politically. An insistence on sustainable growth and businesses practices is laudable, but by no means ambitious enough.

### **Universality**

It is not clear whether the OWG truly considers the post-2015 agenda to be universally applicable, for all countries and all people. While the document uses terms such as 'for all' or 'universal' more frequently than the previous iteration, it lacks the sense that the challenges and solutions are global and that that each and every country is supposed to contribute to the achievement of every goal. Since a number of issues addressed are largely concerns of developing countries, the issue of universality could remain open to interpretation for those countries which feel that the post-2015 agenda is largely for 'others' to implement. We strongly urge Member States to ensure that the OWG clearly states that the post-2015 framework should be universal, and set out a proposal for a single, coherent, universal framework which applies to all countries.

We look forward to further supporting your negotiations within the OWG, and stand ready to provide further practical suggestions.

Yours sincerely



Leo Williams  
International Coordinator  
**Beyond 2015**



Philipp Schönrock  
Director, CEPEI (Colombia)  
Interim Co-Chair, **Beyond 2015**

**Beyond 2015 comments on the  
Working Document for 5 – 9 May Session of Open Working Group**

**Focus area 1. Poverty eradication, building shared prosperity and promoting equality**

**End poverty in all its forms everywhere**

- a) ~~eradicate extreme poverty by 2030<sup>1</sup>~~ **[ADD: By 2030, ensure that no one lives with less than 2 dollars per day, and reduce relative poverty according to national poverty lines.]**
- b) reduce the proportion of people **[ADD: of all ages]** living below national poverty lines<sup>2</sup> by 2030
- c) by 2030 implement nationally appropriate **quality** social protection measures **[ADD: to guarantee a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of all people of all ages,]** including **[ADD: a commitment by all countries to ensure a social protection floor for all people]** floors<sup>3</sup>, with focus on coverage of the most marginalized<sup>4</sup>
- d) build resilience of the poor and reduce by x% deaths **[ADD:],** and economic losses **[ADD: and impact on poverty eradication]** related to disasters<sup>5</sup>
- e) achieve **[ADD: decent work that provides living wages, benefits and social protection for all,]** ~~full and productive employment for all,~~ including women and young people<sup>6</sup>
- f) ensure **[ADD: global]** equality of economic opportunity for all women and men<sup>7</sup>, including secure rights to own land, property and other productive assets, **[ADD inheritance]** and access to financial services for all women and men **[ADD: including the poorest and most marginalised].**<sup>8</sup>

**Comments:**

Aiming to eradicate only 'extreme poverty' - the number of people living on less than USD 1.25 a day - is not ambitious enough and does not serve the objective of realising everyone's human rights.

**Focus area 2. Sustainable agriculture, food security and nutrition**

**End hunger and improve nutrition for all through sustainable agriculture and improved **[ADD: nutrition-focused]** food systems**

- a) **ensure food sovereignty in order to achieve that]** all people have access all year round to adequate **[ADD: safe, sustainable, affordable, diverse and nutritious** food all year round **[ADD: which meets food-based dietary recommendations]**<sup>9</sup>
- b) end malnutrition in all its forms, notably stunting in children **[ADD: especially under two years of age]** and wasting in children under five years of age<sup>10</sup>
- c) by 2030 ensure sustainable food production systems with high yields, and reduce intensity of use of water by at least x%, chemicals by at least y%, and energy by at least z%<sup>11</sup>
- d) by 2030 **[ADD: increase by x%]** achieve access to adequate inputs, knowledge, productive resources, financial services and markets for small farmers and fishers, with a particular focus on women and indigenous peoples<sup>1</sup>
- e) reduce the global rate of loss and waste along the food supply chain by 50 percent by 2030<sup>13</sup>

f) all countries have in place sustainable land-use policies by 2020, and all drought-prone countries develop and implement drought preparedness policies by 2020<sup>14</sup>

g) achieve climate-smart agriculture that is resilient and adaptable to extreme weather including drought, climate change and natural disasters<sup>15</sup>

h) achieve by 2030 protection of agricultural biodiversity, including through use of the practices and local knowledge related to agro-biodiversity and diversity of food<sup>16</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

#### Comments:

Unlike the earlier text, this lacks reference to harmful agricultural subsidies and tackling food volatility - these should be brought back in.

It also misses the role of MNCs and land grabbing that can have negative effects on food security which should be addressed.

### Focus area 3. Health and population dynamics

#### Healthy life at all ages for all

a) by 2030 reduce the maternal mortality ratio to less than 40 per 100,000 live births<sup>17</sup>, end preventable new-born and child deaths and reduce by x% child and maternal morbidity<sup>18</sup>

b) **[ADD: Guarantee equitable, universal and affordable access to prevention, treatment, care and support for HIV, TB, malaria and other infectious diseases, and prevent the emergence of new infectious diseases.]** ~~by 2030 end the epidemics of HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and neglected tropical diseases<sup>19</sup>~~

c) reduce by x% the risk of premature mortality from non-communicable diseases (NCDs), **[malnutrition]** and injuries and promote mental health (ADD: for all people) with strong focus on prevention<sup>20</sup>

d) achieve universal health coverage (UHC), including financial risk protection, with particular attention to the most marginalized<sup>21</sup>

e) by 2030 ensure universal access to affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all<sup>22</sup>

f) **[ADD: by 2030,]** ensure universal access to **[ADD: quality,]** comprehensive, **[ADD: integrated and affordable]** sexual and reproductive health **[ADD: and rights]**, including modern methods of family planning **[ADD: for all people, with a particular focus on marginalised groups]**<sup>23</sup>

g) decrease by x% the number of deaths and illnesses from indoor and outdoor air pollution and other ~~forms of environmental degradation~~ **[ADD: environmental determinants of health through priority health interventions and actions]**<sup>24</sup>

h) **[DELETE ]** ~~Eliminate narcotic drug and substance abuse<sup>25</sup>~~

**[ADD: i) by 2030 increase by x years healthy life expectancy at birth and at age 60]**

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

Human rights based approaches should set the baseline.

The target on elimination of narcotic drugs should be eliminated. This approach has long been discredited and can lead to significant harm, for human rights at large and for the AIDS response. It does not at all reflect the breaking of the (repressive) Vienna consensus on international drug policy, and it pre-empts the upcoming UNGASS on drugs in 2016. According to the notes, it was proposed by Sweden and the Women's Major Group – but our understanding is that the Women's Major Group do not support this language.

Violence against women and girls is a major public health problem globally but it is not mentioned in this Focus Area, despite the fundamental role the health sector has to play and the devastating consequences of harmful practices and sexual and gender-based violence for mental, psychological, physical and sexual and reproductive health. The links to a target under Focus Area 5 on gender equality are noted, but it will be important to ensure an explicit mention or linkage under the focus area on health to guide implementation and investments.

#### **Focus area 4. Education and life-long learning**

##### **Provide quality education and life-long learning for all**

- a) by 2030 ensure universal, free, equitable access to and completion of **[ADD: at least]** quality primary and secondary education **[ADD: adequately resourced by qualified teachers,]** for all girls and boys, leading to effective learning outcomes<sup>26</sup>
- b) ensure that persons with disabilities **[ADD; indigenous peoples, ethnic minorities, persons living in rural areas, migrants and other marginalised groups]** have **[ADD; equal]** access to **[ADD: quality, acceptable],** inclusive education, skills development and vocational training<sup>27</sup>
- c) by 2030 increase by x% the proportion of children able to access and complete quality pre-primary education<sup>28</sup>
- d) by 2030 achieve universal youth and adult literacy, with particular attention to women and the most marginalized<sup>29</sup>
- e) by 2030 increase by x% the number of young and adult women and men with vocational training, technical, engineering and scientific skills<sup>30</sup>
- f) integrate relevant knowledge and **[ADD: life]** skills in education curricula, including ICT skills<sup>31</sup>, **[ADD: the importance of good nutrition, especially in pregnancy and early childhood, education on human rights, climate change and its impacts]**education for sustainable development, and awareness raising on culture's contribution to sustainable development<sup>32</sup>
- g) all schools to provide safe and healthy learning environment for all students<sup>33</sup> **[ADD: with particular attention children belonging to vulnerable and marginalised groups]**

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

This FA no longer includes a target focusing on life-long learning (which should not be confined to adult literacy and vocational training for adults). It has also lost the specific references to 'indigenous peoples, ethnic minorities, persons living in rural areas and migrants'. These should be reinstated.

Human rights based approaches should underpin this focus area, which should clearly state that everyone has the right to education. Education needs to be provided in a safe and secure environment, or access and completion will not be guaranteed.

## **Focus area 5. Gender equality, and women's empowerment [ADD: and the full realisation of the human rights of women and girls]**

### **Attain gender equality and women's empowerment [ADD: of women and girls of all ages] everywhere**

- a) by 2030 end all forms of discrimination against women **[ADD: and girls]** of all ages<sup>34</sup> **[ADD: , revoking all gender-discriminatory legislation which criminalises or stigmatises different social groups, and ensuring access to justice and effective remedial mechanisms for human rights violations]**
- b) **[ADD: provide universal access to critical services, rehabilitation, justice and remedies for all victims/survivors of gender-based violence, and]** by 2030 end **[ADD: all forms of]** violence against women and girls<sup>35</sup>
- c) by 2030 ensure equal **[ADD: universal and free]** access to education at all levels<sup>36</sup> **[ADD: with a focus on the most marginalised women and girls, including indigenous peoples, ethnic minorities, those living with disabilities, those living in rural areas and migrants]**
- d) by 2030 ensure equal employment opportunities for women and equal pay for equal work<sup>37</sup>
- e) by 2030 ensure equal access to, and control of, assets and resources, including **[ADD: land, property, inheritance and productive resources, including]** natural resources management<sup>38</sup>
- f) ensure equal participation **[ADD: influence]** and leadership of women in **[ADD: social, economic and political]** decision-making **[at all levels,]** in public and private institutions<sup>39</sup> **[ADD: including in conflict- and disaster-affected settings and environmental management]**
- g) by 2030 end **[ADD: harmful practices against women and girls, especially]** child, early and forced marriage<sup>40</sup> **[ADD: and female genital mutilation]**
- h) ~~by 2030 reduce the burden of unpaid care work~~ **[ADD: by 2030 reduce and redistribute unpaid care and domestic work through shared responsibility by states, the private sector, communities, women and men ,and ensure that care is incorporated into social protection systems through allowances, services, and benefits that maximize women's autonomy.]** <sup>41</sup>
- i) **[ADD: by 2030, ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and rights and comprehensive sexuality education, to guarantee sexual, bodily and reproductive autonomy]**

**free from stigma, coercion discrimination and violence, for all women and girls]** by 2030 ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights<sup>42</sup>

j) promote the availability of gender disaggregated data **[ADD: and human rights impact analyses of budget and tax policies across disadvantaged groups,]** to improve gender equality policies, including gender sensitive budgeting<sup>43</sup>

**[ADD: k) Removal of legal and policy barriers that hinder access to sexual and reproductive health care services, and eliminate laws and harmful practices that criminalize sexuality and reproductive autonomy.]**

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

Women's roles should be examined in three areas (social or civic participation, economic and political).

An indicator on elimination of harmful traditional practices, including female genital mutilation, should be reflected. Welcoming the reference to ending violence against women and girls, a concrete area that should be reflected is "universal access to critical services, rehabilitation, justice and remedies for all victims/survivors of gender-based violence". Also, redressing the disproportionate burden of unpaid care work on women and girls should be reflected, including through family-friendly policies that enable women (including disabled women, women living with HIV, and others) to balance productive and reproductive responsibilities (such as through maternity and paternity leave, affordable care for children, the elderly).

## Focus area 6. Water and sanitation

### Water and sanitation for a sustainable world

a) by 2030, **[ADD: ensure the right to water and sanitation, and]** provide universal access to safe and **[and ADD:;]** affordable **[ADD: and sustainable]** drinking **[ADD: potable]** water, sanitation and hygiene<sup>44</sup>, **[ADD: including in households, schools, health facilities, workplaces and refugee camps, progressively eliminating inequalities in access including inequality based on gender, age and disability]** especially for women and girls<sup>45</sup>

b) by 2030, improve wastewater management, recycling and reuse by x% **[ADD: and ensure it is efficient, sustainable, scientifically-based and climate-sensitive]**<sup>46</sup>

c) by 2030, improve water-use efficiency<sup>47</sup> by x% in all sectors, with particular focus on agriculture<sup>48</sup>

d) implement integrated **[ADD: sustainable, participatory, accountable and climate-sensitive]** water resource **[ADD: and river basin]** management, including appropriate trans-boundary co-operation<sup>49</sup>

e) by 2030, bring fresh water extraction in line with sustainable supply, protect and restore ecosystems, to provide water-related services<sup>50</sup>

f) by 2030, significantly improve water quality, eliminate pollution and dumping of toxic materials in water bodies, and protect aquifers<sup>51</sup>

g) invest in water harvesting and storage technologies, and double the rainwater harvested by 2030<sup>52</sup>

h) **[ADD: Increase the investment in pro-poor adaptation and resilience and]** decrease by x% mortality and serious injuries, and decrease economic losses caused by water-related disasters, by 2030 <sup>53</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

## Focus area 7. Energy

**Ensure access to affordable, sustainable, and reliable [ADD safe, secure] modern energy for all**

a) by 2030 ensure universal access to sustainable **[ADD: affordable, safe, secure and reliable]** modern energy services<sup>54</sup>

b) double<sup>55</sup> the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix **[ADD: and ensure at least 45% of all primary energy use from renewable sources]** by 2030<sup>56</sup>

c) **[ADD: triple]** double<sup>57</sup> the global rate of improvement in energy efficiency, including in buildings, industry, agriculture and transport, by 2030 **[ADD: and improve energy intensity (energy/unit GDP) of at least 4.5% year on year]**<sup>58</sup>

d) by 2030 increase by x% the share of clean and low- or zero-emission energy technologies, including sustainable biomass and advanced cookstoves<sup>59</sup>

e) **[ADD: Take immediate steps to phase out and eliminate fossil fuel and nuclear production and consumption subsidies while protecting low income and vulnerable populations from negative impacts, shifting this support to provide universal access to energy, renewable energy alternatives and energy efficiency.]** by phase-out fossil fuel subsidies<sup>60,61</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

Specific targets should be in line with science. Precautionary, polluter-pays and CBDR principles should be applied.

In order to be sustainable and effective towards ending inequalities, the SDGs must make concrete links between macroeconomic policy and social policy.



## Focus area 8. Economic growth **[ADD: development,]** employment and infrastructure

### Promote sustainable, inclusive and sustained economic growth and decent jobs for all

- a) **[ADD: economic development is inclusive, pro-poor and sustainable through the reduction of income inequalities between the top and bottom quintiles] [OR REWORD as: prioritise and]** sustain income growth of the bottom 40% of the income distribution of each country **[ADD: including through progressive tax systems and redistributive policies]**, to reduce income by 2030 **[ADD: at a level sufficient to reduce income inequalities by 2030, whilst ensuring economies operate within safe ecological boundaries]**<sup>62</sup>  
**[ADD: b) countries progressively introduce expanded measures of progress beyond GDP into national accounting, with supportive statistical capacity building]**
- b) achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all who seek employment including for marginalized groups by 2030<sup>63</sup>
- c) halve the number of youth not in employment, education or training by 2020<sup>64</sup>
- d) by 2030 improve by x% the energy and resource **[ADD: efficiency and]** productivity of economic activities<sup>65</sup> and reduce by y% their waste and emissions per unit of output **[ADD: to ensure economies operate within safe ecological boundaries]**<sup>66</sup>
- e) create appropriate climate for SMEs, entrepreneurship and innovation by 2020 <sup>67</sup>
- f) increase the share of high productivity sectors and activities in the economy<sup>68</sup>, and strengthen productive capacities through technological upgrading and greater value addition, with a particular focus on LDCs **[ADD: whilst ensuring economies operate within safe ecological boundaries]** <sup>69</sup>
- g) develop sustainable infrastructure accessible to all<sup>70</sup>, **[ADD: that does no harm to people or the environment,]** with attention to needs of countries in special situations<sup>71</sup>, and by 2030 provide access for 100% of rural populations to basic infrastructure and services<sup>72</sup>
- h) protect the rights of all workers, including migrant workers, in compliance with ILO fundamental rights at work<sup>73</sup>
- i) end child labour by 2030<sup>74</sup>
- j) encourage formalization of **[ADD: support the transition of]** informal sector activities and employment: **into more stable and formal environments]**<sup>75</sup>  
**[ADD: k) by 2030 older workers are provided access to education or vocational training, re-skilling or other means to maintain their employability.]**  
**[ADD: l) social security protection, access to credit for youth, women and vulnerable groups, and climate-smart infrastructure with improved resilience to disasters]**

#### Comments

This focus area better delivers inclusive and sustained growth compared to previous versions but does not sufficiently ensure sustainable economic growth as promised in its title.

Conditions for shared prosperity must be addressed, for example companies paying taxes in the country of operation, thereby increasing a country's domestic resources.

There are no proposals on how to avoid future economic and financial crises.

Macroeconomic policy and regulatory and fiscal systems are crucial and should be brought back in from the previous version, and these dimensions specified by incorporating alternative GDP indicators, sovereign debt, a sustainable framework for loans, financial regulation, harmful agricultural and fossil fuel subsidies, polluter pays principles, intellectual property rights, exchange rates, illicit financial flows, transparency and so on.

At a minimum, the private sector must do no harm. The framework must reflect current international consensus that governments have a duty to protect human rights through the proper oversight and regulation of private actors, especially of business and private financial actors, to guarantee in practice that they respect human rights and the environment, including in their cross-border activities. The targets should build on UN Ruggie principles on business and human rights and support a new binding treaty on corporate accountability, including mandatory reporting requirements on corporations' social, environmental and economic accountability using country-by-country/project-by-project model.

## **Focus area 9. Industrialization and promoting equality among nations**

### **Promote sustainable industrialization and equality among nations**

- a) ensure adequate policy space<sup>76</sup> and a conducive policy environment for industrial development, including encouragement of industrial entrepreneurship and enterprise formation with inclusion of SMEs<sup>77</sup>
  - b) create decent industrial sector jobs and promote job-rich industrial development<sup>78</sup>
  - c) achieve high productivity levels across industrial sectors in all countries<sup>79</sup>
  - d) by 2030 increase industrial diversity particularly in developing countries, with a focus on shifting towards higher value-added activities<sup>80</sup>
  - e) by 2030, increase by x% the resource-efficiency of industry<sup>81</sup>, reduce by y% harmful chemicals used and waste generated<sup>82</sup>, and decrease by z% the intensity of carbon emissions from **[ADD: economies (CO<sub>2</sub>e/GDP-ppp) against a historical baseline of xxxx, especially in]** the industrial sector<sup>83</sup>
  - f) increase by a factor of x the share of environmentally sustainable products and services in GDP<sup>84</sup>
  - g) by 2020 implement plans and measures to strengthen the technological capabilities of industrial sectors, including plans to accelerate development and adoption of environmentally sound industrial technologies and processes<sup>85</sup>
  - h) by 2030 retrofit x% of existing industries on global level based on energy and resource-efficient technologies and environmentally sound industrial processes
- [ADD: i) Reduce economic inequality within countries [by x%], and between countries [by y%], including through progressive tax systems and distributive mechanisms at national and international level.]**

Appropriate means of implementation

**Comments:**

Beyond 2015 urges caution as regards any reference to improving productivity (point 9(c)), since this could be inferred to include labour productivity and as such lead to reducing workforce size.

The important reference to environmental and social impact assessments has been lost in this version and should be included under the focal area on economic growth and infrastructure (focus area 8).

We are extremely concerned by the deletion of Focus Area 12: 'Promote Equality'. The fact that the OWG is trying to mainstream equality across several focal areas, and integrate it into 'industrialization and growth', points towards addressing inequalities solely through the prism of economic growth. This departure weakens the 'leave no one behind' principle and seems to place trickle-down economics as the main driver of sustainable development. Equality is fundamental and should be featured under each focus area but should also be a focus area of its own, and we ask Member States to continue pushing for the inclusion of equality as a separate focus area.

**Focus area 10. Sustainable cities and human settlements**

**Build inclusive, safe and sustainable cities and human settlements**

- a) By 2030, ensure universal access to adequate and affordable housing and basic services **[ADD: and a healthy environment]** for all<sup>86</sup>, **[ADD: and ensure that all people are able to live a life of dignity in settlements that are appropriate for their livelihoods and social context]** and ~~eliminate slum-like conditions everywhere~~<sup>87</sup>
- b) By 2030, provide access to safe, affordable, accessible and sustainable transport for all<sup>88</sup>, improve road safety<sup>89</sup> and urban air quality<sup>90</sup>
- c) enhance capacities for integrated urban planning and management<sup>91</sup>
- d) by 2030, reduce the ecological footprints of cities by x%<sup>92</sup>
- e) by 2020, increase by x% the number of cities adopting and implementing policies and plans towards resilience and adaptation to climate change and natural disasters<sup>93</sup>
- f) by 2030 enhance social cohesion and personal security, and ensure universal access to inclusive and safe public spaces<sup>94</sup>
- g) by 2030 ensure that all cities are accessible and offer opportunities to persons with disabilities<sup>95</sup>
- h) protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage<sup>96</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

The OWG should re-insert reference to the positive economic and social links between cities, peri-urban and rural areas since cities rely on the services provided by surrounding rural areas.

## Focus area 11. Sustainable Consumption and Production

### Promote sustainable consumption and production patterns

- a) by 2030 achieve sustainable management and use of natural resources<sup>97</sup>
- b) by 2030 reduce waste by x% through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse<sup>98</sup>
- c) improve the resource productivity of economic activities by x%<sup>99</sup>, including through sustainable supply chains by 2030<sup>100</sup>
- d) by 2030 **[ADD: reduce overall consumption, with a redistribution of resources towards poor communities and poor countries. This requires a shift in values, changing lifestyles, reducing consumption (of, for example, energy, water, food), reconfiguring modes of production, and]** redouble efforts to raise awareness for creating a culture of sufficiency and sustainable lifestyles<sup>101</sup>, including sustainability information on products and services<sup>102</sup>
- e) by 2020, encourage economic incentives that promote sustainable consumption and production patterns including through a product life-cycle approach **[ADD: increase in nutrition-focused production of foods and reduction in processed-food consumption and production.]**<sup>103</sup>
- f) by 2030 increase by x percentage points the share of companies reporting on corporate social and environmental **[ADD: accountability]** responsibility<sup>104</sup>, including integrated reporting<sup>105</sup>
- g) by 2030, all financial sector actors incorporate sustainable development principles in their business practices<sup>106</sup>
- h) create incentives for sustainable tourism<sup>107</sup>
- [ADD: i) incorporation of externalities in production models and pricing, i.e. full cost accounting.**
- j) measurement of global footprints of consumption and production, for example in terms of water, raw materials, land use and greenhouse gas emissions, with a view to reducing by x% by 2030.**
- k) encourage the private sector to address all aspects of their own consumption and production, including the need to shorten supply chains as far as possible]**

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

This FA continues to discuss sustainability of consumption and production patterns, and does not include a focus on changing lifestyles or reducing consumption. It does not mention the triple

bottom line as a way of measuring business performance in other ways than just classical economic growth.

Corporate accountability needs to be incorporated, as well as mandatory and standardised social, environmental and economic country by county reporting.

This FA should mention the need for governance to achieve sustainable patterns, for example green taxes.

## **Focus area 12. Climate change**

**Take urgent and significant action to mitigate and adapt to climate change  
Build a climate change goal based on the outcome of COP21 of the UNFCCC**

- a) hold the increase in global average temperature below an ~~an~~ **[ADD: 1.5]**°C rise in accordance with international agreements<sup>108</sup>
- b) build resilience and adaptive capacity to climate induced hazards **[ADD: , especially]** in all vulnerable countries **[ADD: and poor communities]**
- c) integrate climate adaptation and emissions reductions into **[ADD: economy-wide, low-carbon]** development plans and poverty reduction strategies<sup>110</sup>
- d) introduce instruments and incentives ~~for~~ **[ADD: to eliminate investment in fossil fuels while increasing]** investments in low-carbon solutions **[ADD: in infrastructure, industry, agriculture, transport, energy and all economic sectors]** ~~as well as infrastructure and industry and other sectors~~<sup>111</sup>
- e) improve education and awareness raising on climate change **[ADD: and ensure that all actors – from the private individual, through to the private sector and the state - contribute to reducing their impact on climate change in concrete, measurable ways.]**

Appropriate means of implementation

Comments:

Given that the climate change SDG should not prejudge or even contradict the outcome of COP21 in Paris this seems a wise and prudent approach. It emphasises the importance of a legally binding agreement under the UNFCCC process. At the same time it highlights the importance and urgency of addressing climate change as a development issue, and must include mention of actions to reduce, mitigate and adapt to climate change.

## **Focus area 13. Conservation and sustainable use of marine resources, oceans and seas**

**Take urgent and significant actions for the conservation and sustainable use of marine resources, oceans and seas**

- a) by 2030, prevent, control and reduce by x% marine pollution and marine disposal of waste and tailings, including from land-based activities<sup>112</sup>
- b) by 2030, restore and protect marine ecosystems **[ADD: including marine biodiversity, fish stocks, coastal marine areas and high seas]** from destruction<sup>113</sup>, including by halting and preventing ocean acidification<sup>114</sup>
- c) by 2030, regulate harvesting to restore fish stocks to ecologically safe levels that can produce maximum sustainable yield<sup>115</sup>, ~~and~~ support sustainable small-scale fisheries **[ADD: and create an enabling environment for community-based fisheries management]**<sup>116</sup>
- d) develop and ensure the full implementation of existing regional and international regimes governing oceans and seas, including for resources in areas beyond national jurisdictions <sup>117</sup>
- e) by 2020, eliminate illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing<sup>118</sup> and destructive fishing practices<sup>119</sup>
- f) establish Marine Protected Areas, consistent with international law<sup>120</sup>
- g) by 2030, eliminate fishing subsidies which contribute to overcapacity and overfishing<sup>121</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

#### **Focus area 14. Ecosystems and biodiversity**

##### **Protect and restore terrestrial ecosystems and halt all biodiversity loss**

- a) by 2020 halt the loss of all biodiversity, including habitats, and protect threatened species<sup>122</sup>
- b) by 2020 ensure conservation and sustainable use of ecosystems, including through restoration of degraded critical ecosystems<sup>123</sup>
- c) maintain genetic diversity of both farmed species and their wild relatives<sup>124</sup>
- d) by 2030, ensure sustainable management of all forests<sup>125</sup> and mountain ecosystems,<sup>126</sup> halting deforestation and increasing reforestation<sup>127</sup> by x% **[ADD: with respect for the right of the local communities as well as the rights of nature]**
- e) by 2030, achieve a land degradation neutral world<sup>128</sup>
- f) ensure **[ADD: equitable access to, and management of, natural resources]** and fair and equitable sharing of benefits derived from natural assets, including genetic resources<sup>129</sup>
- g) end poaching and trafficking of endangered species<sup>130</sup>
- h) by 2030, eliminate invasive alien species<sup>131</sup>
- i) ~~ensure~~ **[ADD: fully implement existing international commitments and environmental agreements, and ensure good governance including transparency over and participation in decision-making in natural resource use, access to environmental information, equitable access to resources, free, prior and informed consent for local communities,]** inclusion of indigenous and local communities in decision making, and promote traditional knowledge of indigenous peoples<sup>132</sup>

Appropriate means of implementation

## Comments:

This new version deletes the limitation of the halting of deforestation and 'conversion of forests to crop lands', which might open it up to also mean plantations, urbanisation, extractive industries, etc - a critique of the last paper.

The FA should emphasise good governance in terms of transparency of decision-making over natural resource use and access to environmental information, and reiterate the importance of full implementation of existing international commitments and environmental agreements.

## Focus area 15. Means of implementation/Global partnership for sustainable development

### Strengthen global partnership for sustainable development

#### Means of implementation

##### [ADD:

**All Means of Implementation should respect the human rights of individuals, be fully consistent with existing human rights agreements, and ensure full implementation of existing international commitments and multilateral agreements, for example related to biodiversity, land and oceans management, natural resources and climate change, and others.]**

##### Trade:

- a) **[ADD: establish by 2030]** promote open, rules-based, non-discriminatory and equitable multilateral trading and financial systems<sup>133</sup>, including complying with the agricultural mandate of the WTO Doha Round<sup>134</sup>
- b) provide **[ADD: special balanced taxation-free]** access to ~~greater duty-free and quota-free market access~~ to least developed countries in keeping with World Trade Organization decisions<sup>135</sup>
- c) **[ADD: by 2030 establish free and fair]** improve market access for agricultural and industrial exports of developing countries, especially Least Developed Countries,<sup>136</sup> and at least double the share of LDCs' exports in global exports by 2020<sup>137</sup>

## Comments:

The targets should reform trade systems to promote equality among trade partners, recognising the need for special and differential treatment of developing countries, and more equal distribution of profits along the value chain, by x% over y number of years.

## **Technology transfer, technological capabilities:**

d) enhance regional and international cooperation for science, technology, and innovation and solutions-oriented research<sup>138</sup>, and enhance knowledge sharing, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation<sup>139</sup>

e) **[ADD: establish and support a mechanism for]** ~~promote~~ transfer and dissemination of clean and environmentally sound technologies to developing countries<sup>140</sup>

f) fully operationalize the Technology Bank and STI Capacity Building Mechanism for LDCs<sup>141</sup>

g) strengthen institutions and build capacities in developing countries to undertake research, development and adaptation of technologies, including clean and environmentally sound technologies<sup>142</sup>

h) support fully research and development of vaccines and medicines for the common diseases of developing countries, notably LDCs<sup>143</sup> **[ADD: including the use of flexibilities agreed in the DOHA Round for transferring technology for lowering costs of medicine production.]**

**[add: i) support fully research and development on nutrition-related disease, including non-communicable diseases such as obesity and diabetes.]**

## **Financing and debt sustainability:**

i) **[ADD: Ensure adequate financing for development, building on the Monterrey Consensus, with a special focus on the needs of LDCs and LICs, ensuring]** full implementation by developed countries of ODA commitments on an agreed timetable<sup>144</sup> based on agreed principles<sup>145</sup>

j) mobilize additional financial resources<sup>146</sup> from multiple sources<sup>147</sup>, including reducing the cost of remittances<sup>148</sup> **[ADD: and creating a special duty for the financial sector to sustain development.]**

k) encourage long-term private foreign investment and inclusive finance<sup>149</sup>

l) ensure adequate financial resources for investments in sustainable development<sup>150</sup> **[ADD: through specific public policies, with formal mechanisms of accountability, geared toward merit-based projects financing]**

m) ensure debt sustainability and debt relief<sup>151</sup>

n) **[ADD: establish fully inclusive and participatory governance and]** ~~promote inclusive, participatory~~ decision-making at both national and international levels<sup>152</sup>, including the conclusion of reforms for increasing effective participation of developing countries in international financial institutions<sup>153</sup>

o) strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including by **[ADD: implementing a progressive tax system,]** improving tax collection and the efficiency of public spending, reducing tax evasion and avoidance, improving stolen asset recovery, and strengthening systems to harness domestic savings for investment<sup>154</sup>

p) promote sustainable public procurement, including through national targets<sup>155</sup>

**[ADD: q) By 2030, encourage financial resources from all sources, including domestic resource mobilization and allocation, and increase priority to gender equality in official development assistance, as well as the creation of voluntary innovative financing mechanisms.]**



**r) Increase budgets by x% to address human rights and gender equality issues in strategic planning frameworks of intergovernmental and national financial institutions]**

#### **Capacity building:**

q) expand by x% globally the number of scholarships for students from LDCs to enroll in higher education programmes in developed countries and other developing countries, with focus on science, engineering and management<sup>156</sup>

r) substantially strengthen capacities for sustainable development data collection and analysis **[ADD: including quantitative, qualitative and participatory data,]** with a focus on generating **[ADD: by income, gender, age, race, urban/rural settings, etc]**, timely and high-quality data<sup>157</sup>**[ADD: which tracks coverage of the poorest and most marginalised]**

**[ADD: s) Develop the capacity of local people to research their own realities, and develop strategies for responding effectively to problems in their communities**

**ADD: t) Enable all people in particular poor and marginalised communities to obtain timely, quality, accessible, reliable and disaggregated information at all levels, in particular about what resources are available, how they are raised and spent, and what they result in]**

s) countries progressively introduce expanded **[ADD: multidimensional]** measures of progress beyond GDP into national accounting, with supportive statistical capacity building in developing countries<sup>158</sup>

t) develop and implement capacity building programmes in developing countries, especially LDCs, in support of the national plans implementing sustainable development goals, including in agriculture, **[ADD: nutrition,]** water, energy, health as well as in disaster prevention and reduction capacity and sustainable natural resources management<sup>159</sup>

#### **Strengthened global partnership for sustainable development**

u) engage all stakeholders **[ADD: including people and their organisations]** in implementation of the SDGs, including through effective, innovative and accountable partnerships in cooperation with governments that mobilize financial resources, develop and disseminate technologies and provide technical expertise<sup>160</sup>

v) **[ADD: establish a multi-level accountability framework, operating at state, regional and global levels. States should be regularly held accountable at each of these three levels for their progress against rapid progressive realisation of these goals]** ~~regular monitoring and reporting of progress on SDGs within a shared accountability framework,~~ including means of implementation, the global partnership among Member States and multi-stakeholder initiatives and partnerships<sup>161</sup> **[ADD: that include government, civil society organizations, and the private sector.]**

w) **[ADD: Ensure that IFIs, governments and the private sector respect human rights and sustainable development, and establish and sustain a global political and legal environment that supports people in claiming and realising their human rights**

**ADD: x) Ensure by 2030 that legal and social behaviours respect the fact that spirituality, cultural values and identity contribute to everyone's and particularly to indigenous people's well-being and form the basis for cultural resilience]**

Comments:

A specific text on an accountability framework is lacking, which reduces the chance of success. However, it is welcome that in MoI v) there are some elements to build on. Accountability of all actors must underpin the whole agenda, and all the focus areas.

The creation of enabling environments for civil society is missing and should be added

The text needs to address transparency, democratic governance and an accountability mechanism with binding commitments, for all actors, including multilateral corporations, which is supported by effective monitoring and enforcement. Further, the agenda needs to be backed by participatory national mechanisms for accountability, and reinforced by regional and international human rights mechanisms such as the Universal Periodic Review mechanism.

With regard to the title of the focus area: all areas should be a global partnership in order to deliver on the concept of universality. This focus area should be more ambitious and inspire a universal approach. It sits oddly alongside some of the zero-based targets elsewhere in the proposal. The same document that commits to full and productive employment for all, for example, commits only to "promote" free and fair trade and takes us little further than current, unimplemented international agreements.

**Focus area 16. Peaceful and inclusive societies, [ADD: security,] rule of law and capable institutions**

**Peaceful and inclusive societies, rule of law and capable institutions**

**Creating peaceful and inclusive societies:**

~~a) by 2030 reduce by x% crime, violence<sup>162</sup> and exploitation especially of children<sup>163</sup> and women<sup>164</sup> including by reducing organized crime<sup>165</sup> and human trafficking<sup>166</sup>~~ **[REPLACE a) with three points:**

**points:**

**a) By 2030 reduce by x% crime, violence and exploitation especially of children and women**

**b) People from all social groups feel safe and have confidence in security provision**

**c) Reduce the irresponsible trade in arms and conflict commodities by X%, and reduce violence and other negative impacts associated with trade in illicit drugs]**

~~b) by 2030 eliminate discriminatory laws, policies and practices,<sup>167</sup> empower marginalized groups,<sup>168</sup> in the social, political and economic fields~~

~~c) by 2030 establish inclusive, participatory decision-making,<sup>169</sup> including at local governments,<sup>170</sup> taking into consideration the interests of future generations~~ **[ADD: Ensure people from all social**

**groups can, without fear, participate in and affect political processes, decision making, and the design, implementation and monitoring of public policies and programmes, at global, national, sub-national and local levels, especially over the generation and use of public resources and the delivery of essential services, and that the full, equal and meaningful participation of women and girls at all public and private spheres is achieved.]**

d) ~~by 2020 provide information and education on a culture of non-violence<sup>171</sup>~~ **[ADD: Ensure that tensions, grievances and disputes within society are being resolved peacefully, inclusively and constructively]**

e) ~~by 2030 implement planned and managed migration policies<sup>172</sup>~~

**f) [ADD: by 2030 ensure the secure enjoyment of basic civil and political rights by all, including the recognition and enforcement of cultural and political rights for specific political and cultural minorities and elimination of every legal and socio-cultural base for discrimination]**

#### **Rule of law, capable institutions:**

a) by 2030 develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels<sup>173</sup>

b) **[ADD: People from all social groups have effective remedies to injustice, and access to and confidence in effective, accountable and impartial justice provision]** ~~by 2030 provide equal access to independent and responsive justice systems including related to~~ **[ADD: human rights, gender equality,]** property and tenure rights, employment, business, taxation, trade and finance<sup>174</sup>

c) by 2020 provide public services for all, including legal identity<sup>175</sup>

d) **[ADD: Guarantee full]** ~~improve~~ access to information on public finance management, public procurement and on the implementation of national development plans<sup>176</sup>

e) **[ADD: By 2030, reduce illicit financial flows, including money laundering, tax evasion, trade mispricing, transnational corruption and bribery by x% and recover at least y% of illicit financial flows.]** ~~by 2030 decrease by x% corruption in all its forms<sup>177</sup> and illicit financial flows<sup>178</sup>~~

f) **[ADD: Ensure that people from all social groups enjoy freedoms of speech, association, peaceful protest, civic engagement and access to information.]** ~~remove unnecessary restrictions of freedom of media, association and speech<sup>179</sup>~~

Appropriate means of implementation

#### **Comments:**

The inclusion of Focus Area 16 on 'Peaceful and inclusive societies, rule of law and capable institutions' is strongly welcomed. This is a politically sensitive issue for a small number of countries, and it is important that consensus can be found and that this area is retained, as it is a key value for **Beyond 2015**, and absolutely integral to the success of the post-2015 agenda. It is also an issue that is of high priority for societies around the world – as reflected in the outcomes of previous expert consultations and official reports.

Generally, the OWG working document priorities for Focus Area 16 focus on mechanisms, policies and actions – many of them broad and cross-cutting – that are expected to contribute to sustainable peace and good governance. It is hard to disagree with the overall directions articulated in most cases. However, these directions need to be translated into targets articulated as specific outcomes that matter to people and that will motivate and guide action. As currently formulated, there is a risk of skewing future development efforts on peace and governance towards the implementation of processes and the development of capacities, without a clear sense of *purpose as to what these processes and capacities are intended to achieve*. In other words, we need to move beyond output-oriented targets towards outcome-oriented targets

The focus area has been substantially updated since the previous version, and is more related to just governance and creation of stable, democratic institutions - though it does not include references to democratic elections or how to democratise international or national institutions.

It would be important to include accountability, including corporate accountability, as well as the external fuels of conflicts mentioned in the previous version, such as illicit arms transfers, and dealing with military spending.

Given the crucial role of human rights, transparency, participation, strengthening civil society, rule of law, peaceful and non-violent societies and capable institutions, it is important to include them here.